

35; Migne, *PL* 16. 1139A; Faller, *CSEL* 82 [1968]: 61) renders this sentence: "maximum [*maximus*, MSS] ignis viventibus corporibus dolorem inurit, et gignit corruptionem." It may be added that most of the sources make illness or fatigue the reason for Calanus' suicide: Philo's eccentric story of Alexander threatening to take him on tour (excellently discussed by M. Petit in her edition, *Les oeuvres de Philon d'Alexandrie*, vol. 28 [Paris, 1974], pp. 93–99) hardly justifies the notion that Aelian's Calanus was afraid of "abduction, torture, or murder."

C. P. JONES
University of Toronto

AELIAN VARIA HISTORIA 5. 6 AGAIN

At *Varia Historia* 5. 6, Aelian writes, with reference to a remark made by Alexander upon the self-immolation of the Indian gymnosophist Calanus, that the former struggled against Porus, Taxiles, and Darius, whereas the latter struggled *πρὸς τὸν πόνον καὶ τὸν θάνατον*. In a recent note in this journal,¹ William M. Calder III has challenged *πόνον* here, conjecturing *φόνον*. But the transmitted *πόνον* is surely sound and may be understood in two senses, not mutually exclusive. It may refer to the physical pain caused by the fire that consumed Calanus. According to Aelian and others, he endured it dispassionately and without moving.² Beyond that, Aelian's *πόνον* may refer more generally to Calanus' *καρτερία*, of which his behavior on the pyre is only one example. Indian gymnosophists lived frugally. They stood, sat, or lay—sometimes on stones—naked and motionless in various postures and for long stretches of time under a hot sun. Calanus preached that Zeus, having observed mankind lapsing into luxury and arrogance, had destroyed everything and made life toilsome (*διὰ πόνον τὸν βίον ἀπέδειξε*); virtue and abundance were subsequently restored, but degeneration had set in again, and everything might again be destroyed. Another gymnosophist, Mandanis, taught that men should cultivate a life of *πόνοι* (Strab. 15. 715–16). Strabo's report of these gymnosophistic teachings on *πόνος* is derived from Onesicratus, a pupil of Diogenes the Cynic. Onesicratus, who accompanied Alexander to the East and visited the Indian gymnosophists, not surprisingly saw these ascetics as exponents of Cynic *πόνος*.³

ROBERT J. PENELLA
Fordham University

1. *CP* 78 (1983): 51.

2. Aelian: *ἀτρέπτως εἰστήκει καὶ οὐ πρότερον ἀνετράπη πρὶν ἢ διελύθῃ*. Cf. Cic. *Tusc.* 2. 52; Diod. Sic. 17. 107; Plut. *Alex.* 69; Arr. *Anab.* 7. 3. 5; Lucian *Peregr.* 25. According to Diodorus, while some of the spectators marveled at Calanus' courage and contempt for death, others thought he was mad or vain-gloriously displaying his *καρτερία*.

3. See D. R. Dudley, *A History of Cynicism* (London, 1937; repr. 1967), pp. 39–40, 219–20. Onesicratus, apud Strabo 15. 716, thought of Pythagoras, as well as of Socrates and Diogenes, when Mandanis asked him if gymnosophistic teachings reminded him of anything Greek. For *πόνος* in the Pythagorean tradition, see A. Brinkmann, "Ein Denkmal des Neupythagoreismus," *RhM* 66 (1911): 616–25; W. Burkert, *Love and Science in Ancient Pythagoreanism* (Cambridge, Mass., 1972), pp. 202–3.